

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

**CITTA CONCEIVED THROUGH ITS ELEVATED STATES**

This chapter as continuation of the previous one is also an attempt to depict the citta in the same investigative manner and style as stated in the latter's initial words. The only difference is that whereas the previous chapter deals with the ordinary states of citta, this one deals with the cultivated or advanced states. They are incorporated into the five headings presented in the following pages:

**1. Receptive, Wiely, Ready for Truth Citta.**

**(a) Uplifted Heart:**

The Maha-vagga in the Aṅguttara Nikāya relates the story about general Sīha, the former follower of Nigantha who was converted into a Buddhist after his interview with the Buddha [1].

At the beginning of the sermon addressed especially to Sīha the general, the Buddha taught him on the basic doctrines suitable for laymen as almsgiving, the precepts, and heaven, then the Exalted One continued the sermon with the analysis of the peril, the folly and the depravity of lusts and the blessedness of renunciation.

It was when the citta of Sīha had become clear, malleable, free from hindrance, uplifted and lucid (kallacittam, muducittam, vinivaraṇacittam, udaggacittam, and pasannacittam), the Exalted One began expounding the subtler "dhamma which Buddhas alone have won, that is to say: Ill, its coming-to-be, its ending and the Way. Just as a clean cloth, free of all stain, will take dye perfectly; even so in Sīha, the general, seated there, there arose the spotless, stainless vision of Dhamma; that whatever be conditioned by coming-to-be all that is subject to ending"[2].

It is noticeable that kallacittam, muducittam, vinivaraṇacittam, udaggacittam, and pasannacittam, which can be rendered as clear, malleable, free from hindrance, uplifted and lucid respectively, are acquirable as the consequences of hearing the

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

dhamma preached by the Buddha. The cittas are of course in the state of higher elevation in comparison to the former states before the hearing.

Let us make minuter inquiry into their meanings. In *kallacitta*, *kalla* or *kalya* means ready, prepared; *kallacitta* in some case is compatible with *kammaniya-citta* and casted into the sentences such as 'her mind was prepared for, responsive to the teaching of the dhamma'; *kalla-cittatā* means the preparedness of the mind. So *kalla-citta* in this context mainly denotes the *citta* which has been well prepared by being taught in the basic dhamma; and as the result of this preparation the *citta* gets into the mood of readiness especially for hearing the dhamma, as suggested in the foregoing passage, of the higher level. In progressive terms, the basic dhammas mature the *citta* so as it can get the best out of the advanced dhammas.

*Mudu*, as component of *mudducitta*, means soft, mild, weak, and tender; *mudducitta* is equivalent with *mudduka* in their suggesting of flexible, pliable, and soft. So *mudducitta* suggests a feasible state of *citta* which can easily adapt itself to the outside interference especially, as suggested, the higher dhamma. 'Malleable' should be, I think, the nicest and most suggestive in the context because it reminiscently prompts one of the unique properties of pure gold.

*Vinīvaraṇacitta* is the *citta* characterized by *vinīvaraṇa*. *Vinīvaraṇa* (adj), comprised of *vi+nīvaraṇa*, means unobstructed, unbiased and unprejudiced. So *vinīvaraṇacitta* would mean an unbiased mind. It was, somehow, translated as 'free from hindrance'. *Nīvaraṇa* remind us of the five hindrances, their subvention, and their defiant opposites that we have already discussed in the foregoing heading.

*Udagga*, the combination of *ud+agga*, literally means 'out-top'. When it is used as a modifier of *citta* its figurative meaning would be elated, exalted, exultant, joyful, happy. Hence the rendering 'uplifted'.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

Pasanna means clear, bright; happy, gladdened, reconciled, pleased; pleased in one's conscience, believing, trusting, pious, and virtuous. In combination with citta, 'pious' is selected and pasannacitta is rendered as devotion in one's heart.

In fine, the manipulative employment of the series of citta's modifiers: 'kalla, mudu, vinīvaraṇa, udagga and pasanna' implicitly suggests an untiring attempt to describe the mood of citta where there is so much of wholesomeness that one single term would fail to be satisfactory. Hence many attributes are resorted to.

**(b) Transported Heart:**

In the elegant words the thera Vangīsa expressed in praise of Sāriputta when the latter preached the doctrine in an exquisite manner, we chance upon the udaggacittā again [3]:

And like the myna-bird's sweet song  
His exposition poureth forth.  
And while he teaches, they who hear  
His honeyed speech in tones they love  
Of voice enchanting, musical,  
With ravished ears, transported heart (udaggacittā)  
Delighted, list his every word [4]

As already mentioned, udagga in the elaboration relates to the story of the general Sīha, the combination of ud+agga, literally means 'out-top'; and as a modifier of citta, it figuratively means elated, exalted, exultant, joyful, happy. Hence the rendering 'uplifted' was made in the previous passage.

Udaggacittā here is rendered as 'transported hearts' that in the context resulted from listening to the Dhamma lectured by Sāriputta. The features of Sāriputta's dhamma are comparable to the "myna-bird's sweet song", and with

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

honeyed tones. All this was generated from Sariputta's gift: learned lore, expertise in methods true and false, great wisdom, and conformity to the Norm. So the rendering of udaggacittā should connote the idea of 'positive' in character and 'ascending or rising' in direction which the verb 'transport' is slightly suggestive of.

**(c) Giddy-Patted Heart:**

The following passage relates a delectable legend about the dialogue between a goddess and a bhikkhu. The bhikkhu was in such a relation with the family that his purpose toward tranquillity and emancipation might be, from the standpoint of the goddess it seemed, troubled. In view of warning the bhikkhu from such a distractive circumstance the goddess under the guise of a family woman appeared before him, saying [5]:

Along the rivers, resting by the gates,  
In mote-halls and along the chariot-roads  
The folk foregather and discussions rise:  
Of me it is, and thee now why is this?[6]

The bhikkhu, however, was fully aware of the situation, and though in such an adversity confirmed his positive attitude with the following words [7]:

Ay, there is busy to-and-fro of words,  
And a recluse must bear it patiently.  
Not thereby should he feel annoyed, for not  
Whose at sounds is flustered and dismayed,  
Like any antelope within the woods,  
Men call him giddy-pated, feather-brained (lahucitto)  
The practice he may plan he'll ne'er complete [8].

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

Lahu (adj) means light, quick; lahucitta, 'light-minded'. In the above passage it receives the poetic rendering as 'giddy-pated, feather-brained' which denotes the negative character of the citta. The negative shade was illustrated by the simile: 'at sounds is flustered and dismayed | Like any antelope within the woods'.

Such a mood of citta should be transformed into the stronger one by cultivating the patience. Comparatively speaking, the malleable and open property immanent in kallacittaṃ, muducittaṃ, vinīvaraṇacittaṃ, udaggacittaṃ, and pasannacittaṃ of the general Sīha is recommendable whereas the precarious characteristics immanent in the above-mentioned lahucitta should be safeguarded from. Or else, 'the practice he may plan he'll ne'er complete'.

**2. Calmed, Allayed and Passionless Citta.**

The modifier *vūpasanta* (p.p. of *vūpasammati*) in *vūpasanta citta* means 'appeased, allayed, calmed'. *Vūpasanta citta* denotes the *citta* in the mood of being appeased, allayed, and calmed. In the *Udumparika-Sihanada-Suttanta* of the *Dīgha Nikāya*, *vūpasanta citta* is casted into the sentence: '*ajjhattaṃ vūpasanta-citto uddhacca-kukkuccā cittaṃ parisodheti*' that can be rendered as 'with *citta* serene within, he purifies his *citta* of flurry and worry'. Here, again the *citta* is understood in the double juxtaposed shades of meaning: in '*ajjhattaṃ vūpasanta-citto*' where the (1) instrumental *citta* is used as an internal means to purify the (2) personalized *citta* '*uddhacca-*

*kukkuccā cittaṃ*' which is the object that the act of purifying is targeted on. The spective passage runs[9]: "Putting away the hankering after the world, he abides with unhankering heart (*vigatābhijjhena cetasā viharati*), and purifies his mind of covetousness (*abhijjhāya cittaṃ parisodheti*)... Putting away flurry and worry, he

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

abides free from excitement; with heart serene within, he purifies his mind of flurry and worry (ajjhataṃ vūpasanto-citto uddhacca-kukkuccā cittaṃ parisodheti)..."[10].

the five hindrances that may obstruct the meditating process are often mentioned as five *nīvaranas*. They are:

- (1) *Kāmacchanda*: sensuous desire;
- (2) *Vyāpāda*: ill-will;
- (3) *Thīna-middha*: sloth and torpor;
- (4) *Uddhacca-kukkucca*: restlessness and scruples;
- (5) *Vicikicchā*: skeptical doubt.

In regard to the above *nīvarana* the *nīvarana vagga* of the *Samyutta Nikāya* provides us with the five unwholesome factors that may serve as nourishment for the *nīvarana* and the five wholesome factors that can be resorted to whenever the aspirant for emancipation measures to get rid of them. In other words, the five hindrances to meditative progress are backed by the former and confronted by the latter. All the three groups can be tabulated as follows:

**Table 8:**

HINDRANCE	Backed by	Confronted by
<i>kāmacchanda</i>	<i>subha-nimittaṃ</i>	<i>Asubha-nimittaṃ</i>
<i>vyāpāda</i>	<i>paṭighanimittaṃ</i>	<i>Mettā ceto-vimutti</i>
<i>thīna-middha</i>	(1)	(2)
<i>Uddhaccakukkucca</i>	<i>Avūpasantacittassa</i>	<i>Vūpasanta-cittassa</i>
<i>vicikicchā</i>	<i>ayonisomanasikaro</i>	<i>Yoniso-manasikaro</i>

(1) *aratī, tandī, vijambhiā, bhatta-sammado, līnattaṃ*, all these words mean regret, drowsiness, languor, surfeit after meals and torpidity of mind respectively.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

(2) *arambha-*, *nikkama-*, *parakkama-dhātu*, the three words mean the elements of putting forth effort, of exertion, and of striving respectively.

It is noted that the *uddhacca-kukkucca* is backed by the *avūpasanta-cittassa* and confronted by just the opposite force given by the *vūpasanta-cittassa*. The former is rendered as the mind (*citta*) of non-tranquility; the latter, as the mind (*citta*) of tranquility. The *uddhacca-kukkucca* is a mental mood in conformity with the *citta* modified by either *avūpasanta* or *vūpasanta*. In regard to the *avūpasanta-citta* or *vūpasanta-citta* as catalyst that has most to do with the efficacy or the nullification of *uddhacca-kukkucca*, the *Āṅguttara* passage reads: 'Monks, I know not of any other single thing of such power to cause the arising of excitement-and-flurry, if not already arisen: or, if arisen, to cause its more-becoming and increase, as non-tranquility of mind | In him who is of troubled mind arises excitement-and-flurry, if not already arisen: or if arisen, it is liable to more-becoming and increase... | Monks, I know not of any other single thing of such power to prevent the arising of excitement-and-flurry, if not already arisen: or, if arisen, to cause its abandonment, as tranquility of mind | In the tranquil-minded excitement-and-flurry arises not: or, if arisen, it is abandoned'[11].

'*Cittavūpassama*' is recommended as the suitable state of the *bhikkhus*' *citta*. When the Buddha was staying at *Jetavana*, *Anāthapiṇḍika*'s *ārāma*, there appeared the deva *Kassapaputta* who was encouraged by the Exalted One to utter what he thought of the most feasible activities supposed to be done by a *bhikkhu*. *Kassapaputta* uttered the following *stanza* whose closing words are highly in praising of "the mastering of the heart's unrest (*cittavūpassamassa*)". The text reads:

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

Well then, *Kassapa*,  
say what has occurred to thee.  
See that in what hath been so finely said  
Ye train yourselves: in the recluse's task,  
In mysteries of the solitary seat,  
In mastering of the heart's unrest  
The verse was approved by the Exalted One[12].

**3. Composed *Citta*.**

**(a) Devoted *Citta*:**

In this section attempts will be made to explore the pleasant states of *citta* when it is in connect with the wholesome qualities such as bright, clear, or devoted (*pasīdati*, *-sanna*); springing forward (*pakkhandati*, *-dana*); pure, happy, bright, sinless (*vippasīdati*, *vippasanna* or *pasanna*); remained, established, settled, self-restrained (*santiṭṭhati*); concentrated (*samādhi*); sink down, subside, become quiet (*sannisīdati*, *-sinna*), and the like.

In the *Kosala Saṃyutta* the king *Pasenadi* interviews the Buddha on a series of relating questions. The Lord illustratively explains them all. The king raises the question about the place where gifts should be done to; and where gifts should be done to, consequently the offering renders highly meritorious. The devoted *citta* (*cittaṃ pasīdati*) and the observance of virtue (*sīla*) are said to be strongly recommended for the gifts under question. The *Saṃyutta* passage reads[13]: "The king, the *Kosalan Pasenadi*, said: 'To whom, lord, should gifts be given?' 'There, sire, where the heart is pleased to give (*cittaṃ pasīdati*)'. 'But to whom given, lord, does a gift bear much fruit?' 'This, sire, is a very different question from that which you first ask me. A gift bears much fruitful result if given to a virtuous person, not to

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

a vicious person..."[14]. It should be noted that '*cittam pasīdatī*' could be rendered as the heart full of grace, or settled in faith.

**(b) Springing Forward Citta:**

The Buddha usually sums up all the physical and mental phenomena of existence into the stereotype of Five Khandhas, known as groups or aggregations as follows:

- (1) *Rūpa-kkhandha* (Corporeality aggregate);
- (2) *Vedanā-khandha* (feeling aggregate);
- (3) *Saññā-khandha* (Perception Aggregate);
- (4) *Sankhāra-khandha* (Mental-Formation Aggregate); and,
- (5) *Viññāṇa-kkhandha* (Consciousness Aggregate).

On the basis of the *khandhas*' characteristics of impermanence and unreliability, the Buddha advocates that it is fully fatuous to identify oneself with any of them singly or all of them as a whole. The conceptual understanding of the *anatta* doctrine, however, does not help much in terms of actual practice and realization.

The following story of *Thera Channa* is apt to reveal that it is not easy to bridge over the gap between the understanding of the noble tenet and its life incarnate. The *Channa Samyutta* relates the story about him whose *citta* was in such a perturbing situation. He saw, as the other monks were supposed to do, that all the five *khandhas* are impermanent and would not be identified with *ego*, but his *citta* had not got the desirable states whereas those of the others had. The text runs[15]: "Then the venerable *Channa* thought thus: 'Yes, I too see this. Impermanent is body, feeling, perception, the activities, and consciousness. Body is not the self, and feeling, perception, the activities and consciousness is not the self.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

Impermanent are all the compounded things. All conditions are not the Self. || Nevertheless, for the calming of all activities, for the giving up of all the bases of birth, for the destruction of craving, for passionlessness, for cessation, for *Nibbāna*, my heart springs not up within me. It is not calmed, it is not released from trembling (*cittaṃ na pakkhandati na pasīdati na santitṭhati na vimuccati paritassanā*). But grasping arises, and my mind shrinks back again (at the thought), 'who forsooth is the Self?' This way I can not see the Norm"[16].

*Pakkhandati*, *pasīdati*, *santitṭhati* and *vimuccati* which mean to spring up, to be calmed, to stand still and to emancipate respectively are the predicates indicating the plausible capabilities which the *citta* is to be inherent of. The thing left to the *bhikkhus*' endeavor is the *citta* being properly cultivated.

**(c) Vipprasanna Citta:**

*Satipaṭṭhāna* as a method of mental cultivation which dates back to the early time of primitive Buddhism, occupying the two whole *suttas* which are named after it: *Sutta 22* in the *Dīgha Nikāya* and *Sutta 10* in the *Majjhima Nikāya*. Both the *suttas* have much to do with the cultivation of *citta* and reserve for the doctrine of *satipaṭṭhāna* the unique position in Buddhist practice, considering it as being the most fruitful. In accordance, it receives at the beginning and the end of those *suttas* mentioned the weighty words: "The only way that leads to the attainment of purity, to the overcoming of sorrow and lamentation, to the end of pain and grief, to the entering of the right path, and to the realization of *Nibbāna* are the four Foundation of Mindfulness". It is also known as the four Awareness of Mindfulness (*sati-upaṭṭhāna*), which consists of:

- (1) *Kāyānupassanā* (Contemplation of the Body);
- (2) *Vedanānupassanā* (Contemplation of the Feeling);

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

(3) *Cittānupassanā* (Contemplation of the Mind); and

(4) *Dhammānupassanā* (Contemplation of the Mind-objects).

The *Satipaṭṭhāna Saṃyutta* makes it known to us that the practise should be the subject matter given to the new converts who would get along with it until their attainment of *Arahantship*. The respective excerpt from the *Saṃyutta* runs[17]: "Come ye, friends, do ye abide in body contemplating body (as transient), ardent, composed and one-pointed, of tranquil mind (*vippasannacitta*), calmed down, of concentrated mind (*ekaggacitta*) for insight into body as it really is. | ...In mind (*citte*), do ye abide contemplating mind (as transient), ardent... for insight into mind as it really is. | In mind-states (sometimes replaced by mind-objects) do ye abide contemplating mind-states (as transient), ardent, composed and one-pointed, of tranquil mind, calmed down, of concentrated mind for insight into mind-states as they really are"[18].

It should be noted here that *vipassanā* which is inflected from the verb *vipassati* mainly means an inward vision, insight, intuition, and introspection; *ekagga* means calm, tranquil (usually used for the person just converted but here it is being used in the wider meaning). Both of them are attributes for the *citta*; and the *citta* qualified by such the calmness, insight, intuition and introspection becomes feasible for '*yathā bhūtaṃ nāṇāya*' into the body, the feelings, itself, and its states or what occupy itself. '*yathā bhūtaṃ nāṇāya*' can be taken as the knowledge that is freed from all kind of delusions, and is immune from all kinds of disciplines, philosophical or psychological or logical, exotic to the object to be known. That at this stage of wisdom the seer and the seen are an entity *per se* would possibly be a clue for the prompt question that may be raised: a knife cannot cut itself as is

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

stated by the logic discipline; without violating the logical rule, how the *citta* as a seer can see itself.

'In God We Trust' is held up by the Christians; the Buddhists supposedly rest on 'Off lustful pleasures We Ward', and on 'For Discarding Greed, ill-will and delusion We Strive' instead. In the following excerpt the *citta*, whether in active or in passive position, manifests its positive responds to the supposable mottoes as mentioned above. In regard to the renunciation from sensuous desires the *citta* 'leaps forward, rests complacent, chooses it'; consequently the man who masters such the *citta* becomes 'well lifted up, well freed and detached from sense-desires' and their attendant calamities. The respective passage which the mottoes, for the sake of discussion, would be gleaned from says[19]: "Five elements tending to deliverance. Herein, friends, when a brother is contemplating sensuous desires, his heart does not leap forward to them, nor rest complacent in them, does not choose them. But when he is contemplating renunciation of them his heart leaps forward, rests complacent in it, chooses it. This frame of mind he gets well in hand, well developed, well lifted up, well freed and detached from sense-desires. And those intoxicants, those miseries, those fevers which arise in consequence of sense-desires, from all these he is freed, nor does he feel that sort of feeling. This is pronounced the first deliverance. Similarly for the other four elements, namely, from ill will, cruelty, external objects, and individuality"[20].

**(d) Citta in Samādhi:**

The six *abhiññās* that have already been stereotyped into a popular pattern of expression inasmuch as the Buddhist supernatural powers are concerned. Nyanatiloka in *Manual of Buddhist Terms and Doctrines*[21] mentions six 'higher powers' which are classified into two categories - the first five belong to earthliness

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

and the last one, to super-mundane realm. The former category is 'attainable through the utmost perfection of mental concentration (*samādhi*)'; the later, namely, the extinction of cankers (*āsavakkhaya*) is attainable through penetrating insight (*vipassana*). The later is nothing other than the realization of *Arahantship*. The PALI-ENGLISH DICTIONARY[22] supplies us with a wider sense of the term, namely, 'special, supernormal powers of apperceptions and knowledge to be acquired by long training in life and thought. We can combine the six *abhiññās* from the PALI-ENGLISH DICTIONARY and the MANUAL OF BUDDHIST TERMS AND DOCTRINES into the following list[23]:

- (1) *Iddhi-vidhā* (magical powers or levitation);
- (2) *Dibba-sota* (divine or heavenly ear, or clairaudience);
- (3) *Ceto-Pariya-ñāṇa* (penetration of the mind of others, or knowing others' thoughts or thought-reading);
- (4) *Dibba-Cakkhu* (divine eye, or recollecting one's previous births);
- (5) *Pubbe-Nivāsānussati* (remembrance of former existences, or knowing other people's rebirths);
- (6) *Āsavakkhaya* (extinction of all cankers, or certainty of emancipation already attained or final assurance).

It is noticeable that the first five of such powers are not necessarily attainable among the Buddhists only. The *Dīgha Nikāya* records the instances of the pre-Buddhist *samaṇas* or *brahmānas* who by attaining the *ceto-samādhi* can achieve the *Dibba- Cakkhu*[24]: "In the first place, brethren, some recluse or *Brahman* by means of ardour, of exertion, of application, of earnestness, of careful thought, reaches up to such rapture of heart that, rapt in heart, he calls to mind his various dwelling-places in times gone by... And he says to himself: 'Eternal is the soul; and

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

the world, giving birth to nothing new, is steadfast as a mountain peak, as a pillar firmly fixed; and though these living creatures transmigrate and pass away, fall from one state of existence and spring up in another, yet they are for ever and ever"[25].

That mind-concentration plays the pivotal role of mental elevation in Buddhist practice and in other disciplines as well is absolutely a matter of fact. And, it is concretely specified here that the *citta* in *samādhi* (concentration) is highly puissant in terms of achieving metaphysical powers especially the power to remember the previous lives. But we, by the way, should bear in mind that the knowledge gained from such the divine remembrance till does not reach the truth insomuch as the thought 'eternal is the soul' is regarded as wrong.

**(e) Vitakka and Vicāra:**

Another quality of the *citta* is its settling in the Four Foundations of Mindfulness (*catūsu satipathānesu*); a brief account about this has been already given above. In the *Khanda Saṃyutta* the Buddha explains how to deal with the three kinds of unwholesome *vitakka*. *Vitakka* as a technical term in Buddhist system can be rendered as 'thought', 'thought-conception' that is one of the secondary mental concomitants, and may be karmically wholesome, unwholesome, or neutral.

There are three karmically unwholesome thoughts, namely,

- (1) *Kāma-vitakka* (sensuous thought),
- (2) *Vyāpāda-vitakka* (hating thought), and
- (3) *Vihimsā-vitakka* (cruel thought).

On the other hand there are three karmically wholesome thoughts, namely,

- (1) *Nekkhamma-vitakka* (thought of renunciation),
- (2) *Avyāpāda-vitakka* (thought of hatelessness), and
- (3) *Avihimsā-vitakka* (thought of not harming).

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

It should be noted here that *vitakka* and *vicāra* (discursive thinking) are verbal faculties of the *citta*, in other words they are possibly taken as the so-called 'inner-speech'. They are constituents of the first Absorption (*jhāna*), but disquiets of the higher ones. In the *jhāna* context, whereas *vitakka* whose characteristic consists in fixing the consciousness to the object is the laying hold of a thought, *vicāra* is the roaming about and moving to and fro of the *citta*. Whereas *vitakka* is comparable with the seizing of a pot, *vicāra* is comparable with wiping it; and the pot being object of *jhāna*.

The following passage makes it known that the three kinds of unwholesome *vitakka* are expelled in all quite exclusively by those whose *citta* has already been well settled in the Four Foundations of Mindfulness, and those who have developed properly '*animittaṃ samādhim*' (meditation of formlessness)[26]: "There are these three evil ways of thought, brethren: thoughts of lust, thoughts of ill-will, thoughts of hurting. And these evil ways of thought cease utterly without remainder in him whose heart abides established in the four stations of mindfulness (*catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu supatitṭhita-cittassa viharato*), or who practices concentration that is withdraws from objects"[27].

It is noted that *supatitṭhita*, which serves as a qualifier of the *citta*, is the combination of *su+patitṭhita*; *su* means well, skilfully; *patitṭhita* means established, settled, fixed, arrayed, stayed, standing, supported, founded. But in the translation excerpted above, the denotation of '*su*' (well or skilfully) is omitted.

The worldly machinery that the Buddhist system consents to is accounted on the basis of the interaction between six sense-organs imbedded with six *viññāṇa* and their respective objects. The Buddhist theory of mental cultivation has much to do with their interaction to the extent that it identifies one who controls over the

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

interaction with the conqueror of the world. His *citta* would be 'unmoved, inwardly well established and released' by virtue of that when the sense organs are struck by respective objects he does not allow the arising of longing for or repulsing off them. In the line the *Bojjhaṅga Saṃyuttaṃ* says[28]: "Herein, *Kuṇḍaliya*, a monk, seeing a delightful object with the eye, does not hanker for it, does not thrill thereat, and does not develop lust for it. His body is unmoved, his mind is unmoved, inwardly well established and released (*thitaṃ cittaṃ ajjhataṃ susaṅghitaṃ suvimuttaṃ*). If with the eye he behold an object repulsive, he is not shocked thereat, his mind is not unsettled or depressed or resentful because of that, but his body is unmoved, his mind is unmoved, inwardly well established and released"[29].

The *Sallekhasuttaṃ* in the *Majjhima Nikāya* offers the quite encouraging statement that just the arising of wholesome *citta* is sufficient to render ever much helpfulness, let alone actions in conformity to the *citta*'s wholesomeness. The text runs[30]: "Now I, *Cunda*, say that the arising of thought is very helpful in regard to skilled states not to speak of gesture and speech that are in conformity (with thought). Therefore, *Cunda*, the thought should arise: 'Others may be harmful; we, as to this, will not be harmful.' The thought should arise; 'Others may be those who make onslaught on the creatures; we, as to this, will be those who are restrained from making onslaught on creatures... Others may seize the temporal ... we, as to this, will not seize the temporal, not grasping it tightly, letting go of it easily'"[31].

The *citta* in the above passage should be rendered as thought which tends to function with or without the attendance of actions whether the actions are verbal or bodily whatever. This also may reveal the Buddhist position about the functional relation among the three aspects of one's activities: mental, verbal, and bodily.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

Through the Buddhist scriptures we can see that one's mental actions are closer related to the speech rather than to the body.

**4. Loving Kindness *Citta*.**

*Metta*, usually rendered as 'loving-kindness', stands for the first state of *citta* among the four Boundless States (*Appamañña*) [32]: (1) *Mettā* (Loving-Kindness), (2) *Karuṇā* (Compassion), (3) *Muditā* (Altruistic or Sympathetic Joy), and (4) *Upekkhā* (Equanimity). The stereotypical text of the development of these 4 *Appamañña*, often met with in the *Sutta Piṭaka*, reads: 'There, O monks, the monk with a mind full of Loving-kindness pervading first one direction, then a second one, then a third one, then a fourth one, just so above, below and all around; and everywhere identifying himself with all, he is pervading the whole world with mind full of loving-kindness, with mind wide, developed, unbounded, free from hate and ill-will'. Hereafter follows the same theme with Loving-Kindness being substituted by Compassion, Sympathetic Joy, and Equanimity, accordingly.

The cultivation of the four states of *citta* is considered the basic phase of the uppermost austerity in *Udumbarika Sihanāda Sutta* of the *Dīgha Nikāya* which says: 'In what way, lord, does an austerity win topmost rank and reach the pitch? How good it were if the Exalted One could make my austerities win top rank and reach the pitch! | Take the case, *Nigrodha*, of an ascetic who is self-restrained by the Restraint of the Fourfold Watch. In that he is thus self-restrained, and his austerity is made to consist in this, he advances upward and turns not back to lower things. He chooses some lonely spot for his seat... and, having put away those Five Hindrances, and to weaken by insight the strength of the things that defile the heart (*cetaso*: genitive or dative form of *citta*), abides letting his mind (*cetasā*: instrumental case) pervade the world, fraught with love... pity... sympathy... equanimity' [33].

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

It is noted that the four Boundless States is the preferable practise of the legendary king, the Great King of Glory: "Then, *Ānanda*, the Great King of Glory went out from the chamber of the Great Complex, and entered the Golden chamber and sat himself down on the silver couch. And he let his mind (*cetaso*) pervade one quarter of the world with thoughts of love; and so the second quarter, and so the third, and so the fourth. And thus the whole wide world, above, below, around, and everywhere, did he continue to pervade with heart (*cetasā*) of Love, far-reaching, grown great, and beyond measure, free from the least trace of anger or ill-will[34]". The remaining Boundless States are dealt with in the same pattern. The cultivation of the four states of *citta* especially the second one is highly estimated in the *Mahā-Govinda Sutta* where the ecstasy of pity (*karuṇā*) is singly recommended for the seclusive practise during the four months of the rains.

Consequently, the austere practitioner would be able to commune, converse, and take counsel with *Brahmā*. The text reads: "Then the High Steward thought: 'I have heard aged and venerable *brahmins*, teachers and pupils, say: He who remains in meditation the four months of the rains, and practices the ecstasy of pity (*karuṇā*), he sees *Brahma*, communes, converses, takes counsel with *Brahmā*...' He practised and realised what is thus rumored[35]".

Whereas in the above passage the *karuṇā citta* is the main concern, in another passage we see the focus is on the *mettā citta* instead. The current practices of the naked ascetics at that time such as going naked, being of loose habits, licking hands clean with the tongue, taking food according to rule at regular intervals up to even half a month were claimed by them as the conducts of *Brahmānship* and *Samanaship*. With his own conception of *Brahmānship* and *Samanaship* in mind the Buddha disparaged such the claim

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

and affirmed the outweighing of the cultivation of the *mettā citta* upon the ascetic practices, saying: "O *Kassapa*, when a *Bhikkhu* has cultivated the heart of love (*metta-cittaṃ bhāveti*) that knows no anger, that knows no ill-will from the time when, by the destruction of the deadly intoxications[36], he dwells in that emancipation of heart, that emancipation of mind, that is free from those intoxications, and that he, while yet in this visible world, has come to realise and know from that time, O *Kassapa*, is it that the *Bhikkhu* is called a *Samana*, is called a *Brahmāna*[37]".

'*metta-cittaṃ bhāveti*' is rendered as '(he) cultivated the heart of love' and is standardized as the necessary condition in approaching toward sainthood. This state of *citta* is quality of mind in contrast with anger and ill-will, and is synonymous of mental emancipation. In other words, *metta-citta* is identical with emancipation of *citta*. Between the two equalized propositions there seems to stay a gap which, if any, should be bridged over by referring to the fact that Buddhist doctrine holds that man's emancipation is the emancipation on the basis of no self. *Metta-citta* is the *citta* opened toward others and in somewhat denying its own concern; and the denial goes to a certain extent then it comes to be one's emancipation from self-thought. Hence the identification of *mettā-citta* and the specified emancipation.

The *mettā-citta* being so strongly recommended by the Buddha as above exposition seems to have another cause: it is that which produces more merit than *dāna* (giving) does. He advises the *Bhikkhus* 'to develop it, practise it, take one's stand upon it, store it up, thoroughly set it going, and make it a vehicle and a base'[38]. The passage in the *Samyutta Nikāya* reads: "If anyone, brethren, were to give a morning gift of a hundred *ukka*'s, and the same at noon and the same at eventide, or if anyone were to practise a morning heart of love, a noontide heart of

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

love, and eventide heart of love, even if it were as slight as one pull at the cow's udder (*gadduhanamattam pi mettā-cittam bhāveyya*), this practice would be by far the more fruitful of the two[39].

The same idea is expressed in the following paragraph excerpted from the *Āṅguttara Nikāya*[40]: "Monks, if for just the lasting of a finger-snap a monk indulges a thought of goodwill, such a one is to be called a monk. Not empty of result is his musing. He abides doing the Master's bidding. He is one who takes good advice, and he eats the country's alms-food to some purpose. What then should I say of those who make much of such a thought?". The above underlined 'indulges' is replaced by 'cultivates' and 'gives attention to' in the two next paragraphs respectively[41].

In case a monk wants to put forth another's mistake he should first retrospect upon himself as to whether he is in possession of the five qualities of speech, then he is able to make the contributive comments on others. the five qualities of speech can be listed as this: (1) Being spoken at a well-selected time; (2) Corresponding to the factual not to the false; (3) Of sophisticated words not of harsh words; (4) Well purposed, not carelessly; and the last (5) is that the speech is originated in the *metta-citta*, not in the hatred or the malicious mind[42].

The *mettā-citta* classified here among other modifications of speech is standing for the contributive attitude in the relationship with others. It helps to keep in harmony and happiness the community whose members would find them well conditioned for mutually trusting one another.

**5. Emancipated Citta.**

**(a) Subhāvitam Cittaṃ and Freedom of Mind:**

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

The *Satullapakāyika Vagga* of *Samyutta Nikāya* relates the endurance of the Buddha when his foot was hit and bloodshed by *Devadatta*' splinter. Being imposed on with such the inexorable pain the Buddha did not show out any sign of resentment, let alone ill-will. When he was taking a rest at *Maddakucchi* Deer Park 700 *devas* came and in turn uttered their inspired words in praise of the Exalted One.

Their praising words attribute the praiseworthy attitude of the Buddha to the *citta* being well trained with meditation and emancipation. It is resulted from such the training that the *citta* was freed from all kinds of affections, going on itself in line with the congenial self-denial. The *devas* say[43]: "Behold how his mind is well practised in contemplative concentration and emancipated! (*samādhī-subhāvitam cittaṃ ca vimuttam*) Not strained forth, nor strained aside, nor having restrained [itself] by conscious deliberation, but as having the habit of self-denial. He who could transgress against such a wonder, such a lion, one so thoroughly trained, such a matchless one, such a burden-bearer, a creature so self-controlled, could only so act from blindness; if not, then from what else? [44]".

'*subhāvitam cittaṃ*' means the well-trained *citta*. The phrase '*na cābhīnatam na cāpanatam*' is exegetically explained by *Buddhaghosa* as *rāgānugatam*, *dosānugatam* respectively: '(not) gone after lust or ill-will.' *Nata*, p.p. of *namati* (to bent) can be applied figuratively to constructive work of mind (*citta*) in *Jhāna*.

**(b) Hīnatta-Rūpa and Freedom of Mind:**

Next after the above *Samyutta* passage there is the *stanza* recording the words the *devas* used to belittle the assurance of rebirth in *Brahmā* realm as the goal set up by the heretic ascetics:

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

*Brahmins* of five-fold *Veda*-lore may ply  
Ascetic practices a century,  
Yet would their heart (*cittam*)  
be never rightly freed,  
Such is the low ideal (*hīnattarūpā*)  
at which they aim,  
Not theirs it is to win to the beyond

*hīnatta-rūpā* whose literal meaning is having the quality or nature of 'lowness' gets a little extensile rendering: 'low ideal at which they aim'. We can note from the text that the whole effort to secure rebirth in *Brahmā*-world as an ideal which the ascetic was aiming at was judged to be low or poor because such the effort though is made thorough 'a century', the ascetic's *citta* will not be well freed. It is inferable that the aim of the striving should be well selected otherwise the resultant end '*sammā vimuttam cittaṃ* (freedom of the *citta*)' is bound to be limited. It is noteworthy that the act of *citta* would not be constructive unless the *citta* itself - through intensive and nourishing meditation: the unique measure - is 'serene, pure, translucent, cultured, devoid of evil, supple, ready to act, firm, and imperturbable.' In the *devas*' verses the obstructions that may hinder the mind from freedom are: aiming at low ideal, suffusion by craving, bound to rite and rule, vain conceit, untamed mind. Being conditioned by such the hindrances, the proficiency of the five *Vedas* combined with the ascetic practice however long it may extend, would be resulted in nothing so long as the emancipation of the *citta* is concerned.

**(c) Mental States on Process of Enlightenment:**

In the *Sāmaññaphala Sutta* the Buddha once again praised the blissfulness of such the mood of *citta* as the very fruit of *samañaship* and affirmed that this fruit

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

outweighs all the other fruits he had just elucidated previously such as receiving the protection, veneration and offerings from the king in despite of the possibility of his original servanthood, hearing the *dhamma* taught by a Buddha, leaving the household life and becoming a *samaṇa* out of pure faith, getting well established in the three categories of *sīla*. The passage reads[45]: "This, O king, is an immediate fruit of the life of a recluse, and higher and sweeter than the last. 'With his heart (*citta*) thus serene, made pure, translucent, cultured, devoid of evil, supple, ready to act, firm, and imperturbable, he applies and bends down his mind (*citta*) to that insight that comes from knowledge"[46].

As being possibly subject to the attachment and the detachment (to the five aggregates) the freedom of *citta* from greed is dependable on the latter. The whole process can be presented in a chain of links like the following:

- (1) Contemplating with perfect insight on the impermanence, the suffering and the non-substance of the five aggregates;
- (2) *Citta* being freed from the greed, liberated, rid of the attachment to *āsavas*;
- (3) *Citta* being steadfast;
- (4) *Citta* being happy;
- (5) *Citta* being freed from trouble;
- (6) *Citta* itself faring well; and the last (6) step will be the attainment of the *Arahantship* with the knowledge: 'destroyed is rebirth, lived is the righteous life, done is the task, for life in these conditions there is no hereafter'.

All this gives us the impression that the process of one's emancipation is the process of the *citta* being developed and this process finally culminates in the attainment of the highest sainthood and that there is strong possibility to identify the *citta* with one's own personality.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

**(d) Viratta Citta, Foreshadower of Freedom of Mind:**

The respective *Samyutta* passage reads[47]: "Body, brethren, is impermanent. What is impermanent, that is suffering. What is suffering, that is without the self. What is without the self, that is not mine, I am not that, not of me is this self. Thus should one view it by perfect insight as it really is. For the one who thus sees it as it really is by perfect insight, his heart turns away, is released from it by not grasping at the *āsavas* (*cittam virattaṃ vimuttaṃ hoti anupādāya āsavehi*)... then by its release it (*citta*) is steadfast; by its steadfastness it is happy; by its happiness it is not troubled; not being troubled, of its own self it is utterly well; so that he knows: 'destroyed is rebirth, lived is the righteous life, done is the task, for life in these conditions there is no hereafter.'" The text repeats the same for the four remaining *khandhas*[48].

We should note that in the foregoing passage the *citta* is distinctively described by *viratta* (p.p. of *virajjati*) which means dispassioned, detached, unattached to, displeased with and so forth, and that the *citta* under question is described to be freed mainly from the attachment to *āsavas* which are inherent in the five aggregates. When the *citta* is set free, its emancipation manifests through its immunity to the ten following *kilesa* (defilements):

- (1) *Lobha*, synonymous with *rāgā*: greed;
- (2) *Dosa*: hatred;
- (3) *Moha*: delusion;
- (4) *Māna*: conceit;
- (5) *Diṭṭhi*: speculative view;
- (6) *Vicikicchā*: sceptical doubt;
- (7) *Thīna*: mental torpor;

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

- (8) *Uddhacca*: restlessness;  
(9) *Ahirika*: shamelessness;  
(10) *Anottappa*: Unconscientiousness.

Of which the first three are named *mūla*, i.e. roots, more exactly, the *akusala* roots: *lobha*, *dosa*, and *moha*. Tradition holds that *lobha* arises through unwise reflection (belonging to the realm of *moha*) on an attractive object, *dosa* through unwise reflection on a repulsive object. *Lobha* comprises all degrees of 'attractedness' toward an object from the faintest trace of a longing thought up to grossest egoism, while *dosa* comprises all degrees of 'repulsion' from the faintest trace of ill-humour up to the highest pitch of hate and wrath.

From the text relating to the matter in hand we learn that not only *pīti* undertakes the destruction of the *āsavas* but a number of pleasurable mental states as well. Let us list all: (1) *pīti* (zest); (2) *Sukha* and *somanassa* (pleasure and happiness); (3) *Upekkhā* (indifference); (4) *Vimokkha* (release).

**(e) Tranquilization of Body and Freedom of Mind:**

The *citta* being free as referred to in the following passage is differed from the above ones with the additive '*su-*' (well) as prefix. The *Māra Saṃyutta* relates the story about the futile aggression that the *Māra*'s three daughters exerted upon the Buddha when he was sitting beneath the Goatherds's banyan, on the banks of river *Nerañjarā*, *Uruvela*. The triumph of the Exalted One rendered their attempts into an abject shamefulness. *Arati* (Discontent), a daughter of the *Mara* put forth the question[49]:

How must a brother mainly shape his life,  
Who having crossed five floods

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

would cross the sixth?

How may impressions of the world of sense

Be kept outside of him and catch him not

Who mainly in rapt meditation bides!

The Exalted One replied[50]:

With body tranquilized and mind set free,

*(Passaddhakāyo suvimuttacitto)*

Weaving no plans of deed or word or thought.

Mindful and with no home

where heart may cleave,

Who's heart learnt to know the Norm,

who meditates

Rapt without restlessness of mind, he lets

No anger rise, nor [perilous] memories,

Yea, and no creeping torpor of the wits:

Thus must a brother mainly shape his life,

Who having crossed five floods

would cross the sixth.

*(pañcoghatinño atarīdha chaṭṭham)*

Thus may impressions of the worlds of sense

Be kept outside of him and catch him not

Who mainly in rapt meditation bides[51].

We can note that all the feasible stages in the process of one's cultivation starts from '*Passaddhakāyo suvimuttacitto*' i.e. body tranquilized and mind set free. It is in line with the commonsense that *citta* and body stand for one's personality as a whole.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

The Buddhist cultivation is based firmly on such a ground: the tranquil body (*passaddhakāyo*) and the *citta* being well set freed (*svimuttacitto*).

**(f) Ten Fetters and Four Stages of Sainthood:**

The five and the sixth implied in '*pañcoghatinño atarīdha chaṭṭham*' can be interpreted alternatively as the perils by way of the five senses and those of the 'mind door' or the five lower and five higher fetters. The ten fetters, so called because they can tie beings to the wheel of existence, are listed below:

- (1) *Sakkāyaditṭhi*: personality-belief;
- (2) *Vicikicchā*: skeptical doubt;
- (3) *Sīlabbata-parāmāsa*: clinging to mere rules and ritual;
- (4) *Kāma-rāga*: sensuous craving;
- (5) *Vyāpāda*: ill-will;
- (6) *Rūpa-rāga*: craving for fine-material existence;
- (7) *Arūpa-rāga*: craving for immaterial existence;
- (8) *Māna*: conceit;
- (9) *Uddhacca*: restlessness; and
- (10) *Avijjā*: ignorance.

The first five are called lower fetters (*orambhāgiya-samyojana*) because they tie beings to the sensuous world; the latter five are called higher fetters (*uddhambhāgiya-samyojana*) because they tie beings to the higher worlds, namely, the five material and immaterial worlds. The ten fetters form the traditional explanation of the hierarchical order of Buddhist sainthood, which are ascendantly graded as follows:

- (1) He who is free from 1 - 3 is a *Sotāpanna* or Stream-winner, i.e. one who has entered the stream to *Nibbāna*, the lowest grade of the four sainthood;

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

(2) He who, besides eliminating these three fetters, has overcome four and five in their grosser form, is called a *Sakadāgāmi*, a 'One-Returner' (to this sensuous world);  
(3) He who is fully freed from 1 - 5 is an *Anāgāmi*, or 'Non-Returner' (to this sensuous world); and,  
(4) He who is freed from all the ten fetters is called an *Arahant*, i.e. a perfectly Holy One, the highest grade of sainthood in traditional Buddhism.

**(g) Locus of Mental Emancipation:**

The basic doctrine of Buddhism concerns with the interaction between the sense organs including the 'mind-door' and the outward world of six respective objects. Both the sides has no intrinsic bondage to each other, in other words, they are in nature free of fettering matter. Some exotic bond, however, comes into being in between them due to the desire and lust; to put into proper words, it is the desire and lust that are the bond. Religiously speaking, that is the reason why such a bond of desire and lust can be removed and the Norms of liberation can be pronounced. Venerable *Koṭṭhika* in the *Saṃyutta Nikāya* says[52]: "There is in the Exalted One an eye, friend. The Exalted One sees an object with the eye. But in the Exalted One is no desire and lust. Wholly heart-free is the Exalted One. There is in the Exalted One a tongue... a mind. But in the Exalted One is no desire and lust. Wholly heart-free is the Exalted One[53]".

We can see apparently that it is in between the sense organs and their respective objects the emancipation of the Exalted One takes place, and no doubt, so does the bondage of worldly men. The difference is that the former is due to the desire and lust being eliminated, the latter, due to the clinging to desire and lust. It is noticeable that the Exalted One's liberation is described by the liberation of his *citta* (*svimuttacitto Bhagavā*), it is doubtless, from the presence of desire and

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

lust. though at the risk of going a bit too further beyond what the Buddha might actually pronounce it is in conformity with the logic inference to identify His personality with the *citta*. In reality this idea has developed wide and far in the Northern Buddhism.

**(h) Five Elements of Escape and Freedom of Mind:**

The *Aṅguttara Nikāya* explains the five elements of escape with the passage recorded in its *Brāhmaṇa Vagga*[54]: "Monks, take a case of a monk who thinks on lust and whose heart leaps not up at lustful thoughts, yet becomes not calm, nor firm, nor inclined thereunto; but whose heart at the thought of giving up all leaps up, becomes calm, becomes firm and inclined thereunto - that heart of his is well gone, well become, well lifted up, well unyoked from lustful thoughts; and he is freed from the cankers that surge - lust-caused, painful and burning - nor feels he that feeling. This is declared to be the escape from lust... ill-will... hurt... form... bundle of life... Verily, monks, these are the five elements of escape"[55].

The above passage clearly presents the 5 '*nissaraṇīyā dhātuyo*' or five elements of escape whose distinctive components are five contrasting pairs, each being the mutually exclusive options that one's thought can choose either as its object and reject the opposite. They are:

- (1) *Kāmaṃ* and *nekkhammaṃ*: lust and giving up;
- (2) *Vyāpādaṃ* and *avyāpādaṃ*: ill-will or malevolence and benevolence;
- (3) *Viheṣaṃ* and *aviheṣaṃ*: injury and benefit;
- (4) *Rūpaṃ* and *arūpaṃ*: form and non-form;
- (5) *Sakkāyaṃ* and *sakkāyanirodhaṃ*: bundle of life and escape from bundle of life

Of the above five pairs of moral contrasts, the first constituent of each is immoral, or of the black side; the second, moral or of the bright side. The first pair is

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

presented in the foregoing passage where the *citta* is referred as being '*svimuttam... kāmehi*' (well unyoked... from lustful thought). The *citta* being unyoked or set freed is resulted from the right selection that one's thought does for its objects. Comprehensively speaking, we can put the whole process of cultivation into the following causing order:

- (1) Only the bright side does one's *citta* choose to leap up in, become calm and firm in, incline unto;
- (2) One's *citta* is well gone, well become, well lifted up, well unyoked from the thought on the black side;
- (3) One is emancipated from the cankers and their attendant feelings that are painful and burning, caused by the black side;
- (4) One is freed from the obsessions caused by the delights in the black side;
- (5) Craving is cut off, bolts are rolled back and pride is controlled completely;
- (6) An end to the suffering is made.

It is noted again that the *citta* stands for the forerunner who decides in the act of choosing as found in the (1); and that the *citta* stands for that which is to be acted upon as presented in the (2).

**(i) Ariya Living and Freedom of Mind:**

The liberation of *citta* is manifested also through the context of the ten '*ariyavāsā*' in the following paragraph[56]: "Monks, there are these ten ways of *Ariyan* living, according to which *Ariyans* have lived, do live and shall live. What ten? | Herein a monk has abandoned five factors, is possessed of six factors, guards one factor, observes the four bases, has shaken off individual belief, has utterly given up longings, his thoughts are unclouded, his body-complex is tranquilized, he is well

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

released in heart, he is well released by insight. These are the ten ways of *Ariyan* living, according to which *Ariyans* have lived, do live, and shall live"[57].

The ten, in general, are considered the traditional way of life of the *Ariyans* (noble men). unfortunately, there is not any trace from which we can coax whether an *Ariyan* is necessarily to follow all the ten or some of them or just any of them, and that we can not discern among them which is essential and which is subordinate and ignorable. The inevitable consequence is that it is difficult to make any discernment to the phrase 'well released in heart (*citta*)' that we also fail to elaborate on because the merging of which into the ten may baffle any attempt.

**(j) Five Hindrances and Freedom of Mind:**

the first of the ten, i.e. the abandonment of the five factors, however, is corresponding to the ideas given in the following passage[58]: "Having got rid of covetousness for the world, he lives with a mind devoid of coveting and purifies the mind of coveting (*abhijjhāya cittaṃ parisodheti*). By getting rid of the taint of ill-will, he lives benevolent in mind; and, compassionate for the welfare of all creatures and beings, he purifies the mind of the taint of ill-will. By getting rid of sloth and torpor, he lives devoid of sloth and torpor; perceiving the light, mindful and clearly conscious, he purifies the mind of sloth and torpor. By getting rid of restless and worry, he lives calmly, the mind inwardly tranquilized, and he purifies the mind of restlessness and worry. By getting rid of doubt, he lives doubt-crossed; unperplexed as to states that are skilled, he purifies the mind of doubt"[59].

*parisodheti* (p.p. *parisodhita*; nt. *parisodana*) means cleanse, clean, purify; so the phrase '*abhijjhāya cittaṃ parisodheti*' would mean 'to cleanse one's *citta* (from)'. the objects of 'from' in the above context would be:

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

- (1) *abhijjā* or *kāmachanda* (as a variant): coveting or sensuous desire;
- (2) *Byāpāda* or *Vyāpāda*: malevolence, ill-will;
- (3) *Thīna-middha*: sloth and torpor;
- (4) *uddhaccakukkuccā*: restlessness and worry; and
- (5) *Vicikiccha*: doubt.

All the five are titled hindrances (*nīvaraṇa*) which are obstacles to the *citta* and blind our mental vision. In the presence of them we can not reach Neighbourhood-Concentration (*upacāra-samādhi*) and Full Concentration (*appanā-samādhi*). Without their presence we are better able to discern the truth.

The *Aṅguttara Nikāya*[60] supplies us with the pleasant similes where sensuous desire is compared with water mixed with manifold colors, ill-will with boiling water, sloth and torpor with water covered by mosses, restlessness and worry (or scruples) with agitated water whipped by the wind, (skeptical) doubt with turbid and muddy water. Just as in such water one cannot perceive one's own reflexion, so in the presence of these five mental Hindrances, one cannot clearly discern one's own benefit, nor that of others, nor that of both.

The *Aṅguttara Nikāya*[61] also gives us an account with further details of the origination and the overcoming of the *nīvaraṇa*. The five '*nīvaraṇa*', however, are relatively well informed in the foregoing passage with the addition of the following five counterpoises (which are hopefully stronger!):

- (1) *vigatābhijjha*;
- (2) *abyāpādapa* rigged with *sabba pāṇabhūta hitānukampī* (compassion for the welfare of all creatures and beings);
- (3) *vigatathīnamiddha* rigged with *ālokasaññī sato sampajāno* (perceiving the light, mindful and clearly conscious);

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

- (4) *anuddhata* rigged with *vūpasantacitto* (the *citta* inwardly tranquilized);  
(5) *tiṇṇavicikiccha* rigged with '*akathamkathī kusalesu dhammesu*' (unperplexed as to states that are skilled).

**(k) Sīla and Freedom of Mind:**

the *bhikkhuhood* is set up and sustained based on *sīla* which, however, can not be grasped in a single word. Generally speaking, *sīla* is a mode of mind and volition manifested in speech and bodily action and is considered the foundation of the whole Buddhist practice, and therewith the first of the three kinds of training that form the three-fold division of the eight-fold path, namely, morality (*sīla*), concentration and wisdom. This *sīla* division is also known as genuine or Natural Morality (*pakati-sīla*) as distinguished from the external rules or Prescribed Morality (*paññatti-sīla*) which consists of:

- (1) *Sammā-vācā*: right speech,  
(2) *Sammā-kammanta*: right action, and  
(3) *Sammā-ājīva*: right livelihood.

They, however, have little to do with the *citta*. as a variant of such a basis that helps a *bhikkhu* in remaining and sustaining his *bhikkhuhood* until the last breath, the prescription made by *Thera Sāriputta* are:

- (1) *Indriyesu guttadvāra*: senses being well guarded;  
(2) *Bhojane mattaññū*: moderate in eating; and  
(3) *Jāgariyam-anuyutta*: engaging in vigilance.

The last one has much to do with the care of the *citta* as revealed in the following passage[62]: "And how, friend, is one given to watchfulness? || Herein, friend, by day a brother walks up and down and then sits, and thus cleanses his heart from states that may hinder (*āvaraṇīyehi dhammehi*). By night, for the first watch he

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

does likewise. In the middle watch of the night, lying on his right side he takes up the lion-posture, resting one foot on the other, and thus collecting and composed fixes his thought on rising up again. In the last watch of the night, at early dawn, he walks up and down, and then sits, and so cleanses his heart from states that may hinder. Thus, friend, is one given to watchfulness"[63].

as often as can be, all the activities of a *bhikkhu* night and day ought to be watched carefully by himself with the view to cleanse his *citta* from *āvaraṇīyehi dhammehi* (the things that may hinder). the clearance of the *citta* from "*āvaraṇīyehi dhammehi*" is the ideal commitment that the *citta* should undergo. The possible corollary may be made here is that the *citta* is somehow imbedded as a controlling agent in every activity that one may undertake because the *citta* apparently has so close a relation to one's activities that the latter being watchful may effect on the ideal state of the former: being clean.

**(I) Asalīnacitta and Alīnacitta:**

The other ideal state of the *citta* is '*asallīna citta*' as expressed in the greatest event in the life of the Exalted One: his *Nibbāna*. For the historic event only three *stanzas* are recorded in the *Samyutta Nikāya*. The last one uttered by *Thera Anurudha* in praise of the Exalted One reads [64]:

No heaving breath left as he lay,  
The mind in *Jhāna*'s steadfast stay  
(*thita-cittassa*).  
With thought from every craving free,  
Fixed on the Peace incessantly,  
So passed the Man-who-saw away.  
With mind unshaken

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

(*asallīnena citta*) as they came,  
He suffered pangs of death in peace;  
Stole o'er his heart the last release:  
*Nibbāna* of the unfed flame[65].

*allīna* (p.p.of *alīyati*) covers two ranges of meanings: (a) sticking to, adhering, or adhered to, clinging; (b) soiled by. In the foregoing passage the phrase '*asallīnena citta*' is rather freely translated as 'with the mind unshaken', which, however, along with '*thita-citta*' (steadfast *citta*) fits well to the context of the Exalted One's *Nibbāna*.

The last state of the *citta* in terms of emancipation that we are going to inquire is '*alīna* (unstained) *citta*'. The following canonical passage give us an enjoyable way of displaying the doctrine in which there is a series of links, each link containing the three components. The last and most active component of the preceding link is the root that all the three components of the succeeding link grow out of. There is the exception of the two last links: in the former the middle component is the most active whereas all the three components of the latter share the same footing of importance and cause the last result: abandoning rebirth, decay and death. The text reads[66]:

"Suppose, monk, this one is not shameless, reckless and in lack of seriousness. Being thus with seriousness he can grow so as to abandon disregard, so as to abandon stubbornness, so as to abandon friendship with the wicked. Having not wicked friend he can... abandon lack of faith, stinginess and indolence. Being not indolent he can... abandon flurry, lack of self-control and immorality. Being moral he can... abandon distaste for seeing the *Ariyans*, distaste for hearing *Ariyan dhamma*, and a carping disposition. Having not a carping disposition he can... abandon forgetfulness, discomposure and mental derangement. Being not mentally deranged he can... abandon lack of giving thorough attention, following the wrong way and sluggishness

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

of mind. Being not sluggish of mind he can... abandon view of the individual-group, doubt-and-wavering and wrong handling of habit and rite. Not doubtful-and-wavering he can... abandon lust, malice and delusion. Abandoning lust, malice, and delusion, he can... grow so as to abandon rebirth, decay, and death"[67].

If we filter out all the supplemental components and remake the chain out of the remaining, that is, the most active components, the resultant chain would be:

- (1) *Appamatto*: seriousness
- (2) *Kalyāṇamitto*: with good friends
- (3) *Āraddhaviriyo*: diligence
- (4) *Sīlavā*: being moral
- (5) *anupārambhacitto*: without carping disposition
- (6) *avikkhittacitto*: being not mentally deranged
- (7) *Alīnacitto*: without sluggishness of mind
- (8) *avicikiccho*: not doubtful
- (9) *rāgaṃ dosaṃ mohaṃ pahāya*: abandoning lust, malice, and delusion
- (10) *jātiṃ jaraṃ maraṇaṃ pahātun*: abandoning rebirth, decay, and death.

The most active component of the fifth link, namely, *anupārambha citta* relates to an attitudinal dealing with the defaults of others, which may negatively affect his own mental elevation. In the sixth link (6) the *avikkhitta citta* is identical with a composed state of mind and may suggest its sound condition ready for working. *Līna* (p.p. of *liyati*) means clinging, sticking; slow, sluggish; shy, reserved, dull; and, the *citta* in the seventh-link (7) is freed from any stagnation especially from wrong views and observances.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

[1] *Atha kho Bhagavā Sīhassa senāpatissa anupubbikathaṃ kathesi, seyyathīdaṃ dānakathaṃ sīlakathaṃ saggakathaṃ kāmānaṃ ādīnavaṃ okāraṃ saṃkilesaṃ nekkhamme ānisaṃsaṃ pakāsesi. Yadā Bhagavā aññāsi Sīhaṃ senāpatiṃ kallacittam muducittam vinivaranacittam udaggacittam pasannacittam, atha yā buddhānaṃ sāmukkaṃsikā dhammadesanā, taṃ pakāsesi: ...sabbantaṃ nirodhadhamman' ti: A. iv: 186.*

[2] GS. iv: 128.

[3] *Atha kho āyasmā Vangīso āyasmantaṃ Sāriputtaṃ sammukhā sarūpāhi gāthāhi abhitthavi | | Gambhīra-pañño medhāvī ...tassa tam desayantassa | suṇanti madhuraṃ giraṃ | sarena rajanīyena | savanīyena vaggunā | udaggacittā muditā | sotam odhenti bhikkhavo ti: S. i: 190.*

[4] KS. i: 241.

[5] *Upasaṅkamitvā taṃ bhikkhuṃ | gāthāya ajjhabhāsi | Nadītīresu saṅthāne sabhāsu rathiyāsuca | janā saṅ gamma mantenti | mañ ca tañ ca kim antaranti: S. i: 201.*

[6] KS. i: 256.

[7] *Bahū hi saddā paccūhā | khamitabbā tapassinā | na tena maṅkuhotabbo | na hi tena kilissati | | yo ca saddaparittāsī | vane vātamigo yathā | lahucitto ti tam āhu | nāssa sampajjate vatan-ti: S. i: 201.*

[8] KS. i: 257

[9] *So abhijjhaṃ loke pahāya vigatābhijjhena cetasā viharati, abhijjhāya cittam parisodheti; vyāpāda-dosaṃ pahāya avyāpañña-citto viharati, ...ajjhataṃ vūpasanto-citto uddhacca-kukkuccā cittam parisodheti; vicikicchaṃ pahāyatiṅṅa-vicikicchāya cittaṃ parisodheti; vicikiddhaṃ pahāya tiṅṅa-vicikiccho viharati, akathaṃ-kathī kusalesu dhammesu vicikicchāya cittaṃ parisodheti: D. iii: 49.*

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

[10] DB. iii: 44.

[11] GS. i: 2-4.

[12] KS. i: 65.

[13] *Ekam antaṃ nisinno kho rājā Pasenadi-kolalo Bhagavantam etad avoca*  
|| *Kattha nu kho bhante dānaṃ dātabban-ti* || *Yattha kho mahārāja cittaṃ*  
*pasīdatī ti ...Sīlavato kho mahārāja dinnam mahapphalaṃ no tathā dussīle: S. i: 98.*

[14] KS. i: 123.

[15] *Atha kho āyasmato Channassa etad ahosi ...Atha ca pana me*  
*sabbasaṅkhāra samathe sabbū padhipaṭṭinissagge taṅhakkhaye virāge nirodhe*  
*nibbāne cittaṃ na pakkhandati na pasīdati na santitṭhati na vimuccati*  
*paritassanā upādānam uppajjati paccudāvattati mānasam | atha ko carahi me*  
*attāti | na kho panetaṃ dhammam passato hoti: S. iii: 133.*

[16] KS. iii: 112.

[17] *Etha tumhe āvuso kāye kāyānupassino viharatha | ātāpino*  
*sampajānā ekodibhūtā vipasannacittā samāhitā ekaggacittā kāyassa yathā*  
*bhūtaṃ ñāṇāya || Vedanāsu vedanānupassino viharatha ...ātāpino*  
*sampajānā ekodibhūtā vipasannacittā samāhitā ekaggacittā dhammānaṃ yathā*  
*bhūtaṃ ñāṇāya: S. v: 144.*

[18] KS. v: 123.

[19] *Pañca nissaraṇīyā dhātuyo. Idh'āvuso bhikkhuno kāme manasikaroto*  
*kāmesu cittaṃ na pakkhandati nappasīdati na santitṭhati na*  
*vimuccati, nekkhammam kho pan'assa manasikaroto nekkhamme cittaṃ*  
*pakkhandati pasīdati santitṭhati vimuccati, ...vedanaṃ vedeti, idaṃ akkhātaṃ*  
*kāmānaṃ nissaraṇaṃ: D iii 239. (The following respective passages are formed by the*  
*same mold with kāme and nekkhammam being replaced by the variables (vyāpādaṃ*

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

*and avyāpādam; vihesam and avihesam; rūpaṃ and arūpaṃ; sakkāyaṃ and sakkāya-nirodham) with the attendant changes when necessary.)*

[20] DB. iii: 228-9.

[21] *MBTD.*: 2-3.

[22] *PED.*: 64.

[23] Each predicate is the juxtaposition of the information from *MBTD* and that of *PED* respectively.

[24] *Idha bhikkhave ekacco samaṇo vā brāhmaṇo vā ātappam anvāya padhānam anvāya anuyogam anvāya appamādam anvāya sammā -manasikāram anvāya tathārūpaṃ ceto-samādhim phusati yathā samāhite citte taṃ pubbe nivāsaṃ anussarati... So evam āha: Sassato attā ca loko ca vañjho kūṭaṭṭho esikaṭṭhāyitṭhito, te ca sattā sandhāvanti saṃsaranti cavanti upapajjanti, atthi tveva sassatisamaṃ: D. i: 13.*

[25] DB. i: 28.

[26] *Tayo me bhikkhave akusalavitakkā kāmavitakko vyāpādavitaṅko | ime ca kho bhikkhave tayo akusalavitakkā kva aparisesā nirujjhanti || Catūsu vā satipaṭhānesu supatitṭhita-cittassa viharato animittaṃ vā samādhim bhāvayato: S. iii: 93.*

[27] DB. iii: 79.

[28] *Idha Kuṇḍaliya bhikkhu cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā manāpāṃ nābhijjhati nābhihaṃsati na rāgaṃ janeti | tassa ṭhito ca kāyo hoti ṭhitam cittam ajjhattam susanṭhitam suvimuttam || Cakkhunā kho paneva rūpaṃ disvā amanāpaṃ na maṅku hoti | apatiṭṭhitacitto ādīnamānaso avyāpannacetaso | tassa ṭhito ca kāyo hoti ṭhitam cittam ajjhattam susanṭhitam suvimuttaṃ: S. v: 74.*

[29] KS. v: 61.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

[30] *Cittuppādam-pi kho ahaṃ Cunda kusalesu dhammesu bahukāraṃ vadāmi, ko pana vādo kāyena vācāya anuvidhīyanāsu. Tasmātiha Cunda: Pare vihiṃsakā bhavissanti, mayam-ettha avihīmsakā bhavissāmāti cittaṃ uppādetabbaṃ ...cittaṃ uppādetabbaṃ: M. i: 43.*

[31] MS. i: 55.

[32] also known as the Sublime or Divine Abodes

[33] DB. iii: 45-6.

[34] *Ibid.* ii: 219.

[35] *Ibid.*: 271.

[36] the lusts of the flesh, the lust after future life, and the defilements of delusion and ignorance

[37] DB. i: 232.

[38] KS. ii: 177.

[39] *Yo bhikkhave pubbaṇhasamayam ukkhāsatam dānaṃ dadeyya ...mettacittam bhāveyya | yo vā majjhantikasamayam antamaso gadduhanamattam pi mettacittaṃ bhāveyya | yo vā sāyaṇhasamayam antamaso gadduhanavattam pi mettacittaṃ bhāveyya | idaṃ tato mahapphalataraṃ: S. ii: 264.*

[40] GS. i: 8-9.

[41] *Accharā-saṅghāta-mattam pi ce bhikkhave bhikkhu mettacittaṃ āsevati ayaṃ vuccati bhikkhave bhikkhu. Arittajjhāno viharati satthu ...Ko pana vādo ye naṃ bahulīkarontī ti: A. i: 10.*

[42] *Kālena vakkhāmi no akālena, bhūtena vakkhāmi no abhūtena, saṅhena vakkhāmi no pharusena, atthasaṃhitena vakkhāmi no anattasaṃhitena, mettacitto ...upaṭṭhapetvā paro codetabbo ti: A. v: 81.*

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

[43] *Passa samādhi-subhāvitam cittam ca vimuttam | na cābhinatam na cāpanatam na ca sa saṅkhāraniggayha cārita-vatam ...Cittam ca nesaṃ na sammā vimuttam | hīnattarūpā na pāraṃgamā te: S. i: 28-9.*

[44] KS. i: 39.

[45] *Idaṃ pi kho mahā-rajā sandiṭṭhikaṃ sāmāñña-phalaṃ purimehi sandiṭṭhikehi sāmāñña-phalehi abhikkantaraṇ ca paṇītataṇ ca | So evaṃ samāhite citte parisuddhe pariyodāte anaṅgaṇe vigatūpakkilese mūdū-bhūte kammaniye ṭhite ānejjappatte nāṇa-dassanāya cittaṃ abhinīharati abhininnāmeti...*

[46] DB i 86

[47] *Rūpaṃ bhikkhave aniccaṃ ...cittam virattam vimuttam hoti anupādāya āsavehi || Vedanādhatuyā ce° || Saññādhātuyā ce° || Viññānadhātuyā ce° bhikkhave bhikkhuno cittaṃ virattam vimuttam hoti anupādāya āsavehi vimuttatā ṭhitam ...aparitassaṃ paccattaññeva parinibbāyati || Khīṇā jāti vusitam brahmacariyaṃ kataṃ karaṇīyaṃ nāparam itthattāyāti pajānāti ti: S. iii: 44-5.*

[48] KS. iii: 39.

[49] *Kathaṃ vihārī-bahulo dha bhikkhu | pañcoghatīṇṇo atarīdha chaṭṭhaṃ | kahaṃ jhāyaṃ bahulaṃ kāma-saññā | paribāhirā honti aladdhāyo tan-ti*

[50] *Passaddhakāyo suvimuttacitto | asaṅkhārāno satimā anoko | aññāya dhammaṃ avitakkajhāyī | na kuppati na sarati ve na thino || Evaṃ vihārī-bahulo dha bhikkhu | pañcoghatīṇṇo atarīdha chaṭṭhaṃ | evaṃ jhāyaṃ bahulaṃ kāmasaññā | paribāhirā honti aladdhāyo tan-ti: S. i: 126.*

[51] KS. i: 158-9.

[52] *Samvijjati kho āvuso Bhagavato cakkhu | passati Bhagavā cakkhunā rūpaṃ | chandarāgo Bhagavato natthi | suvimuttacitto Bhagavā ...jānāti Bhagavā*

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

*manasā dhammaṃ | chandarāgo Bhagavato natthi | suvimuttacitto Bhagavā: S. iv: 164-5.*

[53] KS. iv: 102.

[54] *Pañc'imā bhikkhave nissaraṇīyā dhātuyo. Katamā pañca? | Idha bhikkhave bhikkhuno kāmaṃ manasikaroto kāmesu cittaṃ na pakkhandati ...suvimuttam suvisamyuttam kāmehi, ye ca kāmapaccayā uppajjanti āsavā vighātapariḷhā, mutto so tehi, na so taṃ vedanaṃ vediyati. Idam akkhātaṃ kāmānaṃ nissaraṇaṃ... vyāpādaṃ vihesaṃ... rūpaṃ... sakkāyaṃ... Imā kho bhikkhave pañca nissaraṇīyā dhātuyo ti: A. iii: 245.*

[55] GS. iii: 179-180.

[56] *Dasa yime bhikkhave ariyavāsā, ye ariyā āvasiṃsu vā āvasantivā āvasissantivā. Katame dasa? | Idha bhikkhave bhikkhu pañcaṅgavippahīno hoti, chaḷaṅgasamannāgato, ekārakkho, caturāpasseno, panuṇṇapaccekasacco, samavayasaṭṭhesano, anāvilasaṅkappo, passaddhakāyasaṅkhāro, suvimuttacitto, suvimuttapañño [suvimuttacitto]: A. v: 29.*

[57] GS. v: 21.

[58] *So abhijjhaṃ loke pahāya vigatābhijjhena cetasā viharati, abhijjhāya cittaṃ parisodheti; byāpādapadosaṃ pahāya abyāpannacitto viharati ...cittaṃ parisodheti; vicikicchaṃ pahāya tiṇṇavicikiccho viharati, akathaṃkathī kusalesu dhammesu vicikicchāya cittaṃ parisodheti: M. i: 347.*

[59] MS. ii: 12.

[60] A. v: 193.

[61] A. i: 2; A. vi: 21.

**The Mind in Early Buddhism: Citta Conceived Through Its Elevated States**  
**By Most Ven. Thich Minh Thanh**

[62] *Kathaṃ cāvuso jāgariyam anuyutto hoti ...rattiyā pacchimaṃ yāmaṃ paccuṭṭhāya caṅkamaṇa nisajjāya āvaraṇīyehi dhammehi cittaṃ parisodheti | | Evam kho āvuso jāgariyam anuyutto hoti: S. iv: 104-5.*

[63] KS. iv: 64.

[64] *Nāhu assāsapassāso ṭhita-cittassa tādino | anejo santim ārabba cakkhumā paribibbuto | asallīnena cittaṃ vedanam | pajjotass-eva nibbānaṃ vimokkha cetaso ahū ti: S. i: 159.*

[65] KS. i: 198.

[66] *Hirimā'yaṃ bhikkhave ottappī appamatto hoti. So appamatto samāno bhabbo anādariyaṃ pahātuṃ dovacassataṃ pahātuṃ pāpamittataṃ pahātuṃ ...cetaso līnattaṃ pahātuṃ. So alīnacitto samāno bhabbo sakkāyaditṭhiṃ pahātuṃ vicikicchaṃ pahātuṃ sīlabbataparāmāsaṃ pahātuṃ. So avicikiccho samāno bhabbo rāgaṃ pahātuṃ dosaṃ pahātuṃ mohaṃ pahātuṃ. So rāgaṃ pahāya dosaṃ pahāya mohaṃ pahāya bhabbo jātiṃ pahātuṃ jaraṃ pahātuṃ maraṇaṃ pahātuṃ ti: A. v: 148-9.*

[67] GS. v: 101.